

## The Policing Question: Protection vs. Service In 2020

*Prof. Harold McDougall<sup>1</sup>*

The protests sparked by the murder of George Floyd have highlighted some of America's unique challenges. Our culture is shadowed by racial and ethnic subordination, patriarchy, and gun violence. Some feel privileged by our culture, others do not. The police are often called upon to manage disputes and conflicts between and within these two segments of the population.<sup>2</sup>

Members of the "in-group" see the police as their allies, even as their servants, calling the police when they feel their "proper place" is under attack or threatened.<sup>3 4</sup> On the other hand, members of the "out-group" often see the police themselves as a threat. Our gun culture makes the whole situation much more volatile.

What happens to "protect and serve" under such conditions?

### PROTECT WHO?

Protecting the in-group at the expense of the out-group has resulted in an increasing level of aggressiveness, even militarization of the police<sup>5</sup>, as well as a number of secondary effects such as the explosion of the prison population and a spike in civilian deaths. There are many proposals emerging to address this problem, arrayed along a spectrum from reforming, restructuring, and defunding the police to abolition of policing altogether. The abolitionist group Critical Resistance has a chart surveying such proposals according to the degree to which they reduce police funding, reduce the numbers of police, and/or challenge the belief that policing as presently constituted makes us safer.<sup>6</sup> Their chart has been widely circulated, even picked up and reproduced by a writer for the *New York Times*.<sup>7</sup>

### *Reform*

There were a number of reforms in place before the murder of George Floyd, many of them in Minneapolis itself. These include body cameras, community policing, retraining, and civilian review/oversight boards. Critical Resistance dismisses all these as insufficiently moving the dial. Alicia Garza of Black Lives Matter, on the other hand, supports civilian review boards, providing they have teeth – the power to hire and fire police officers.<sup>8</sup>

### *Restructuring*

Since the murder of Floyd, Ahmaud Arbery and Breonna Taylor, a number of more fundamental proposals have entered the conversation. These include prosecuting officers who physically violate citizens,<sup>9</sup> denying them administrative leave, confiscating their pension benefits and preventing their rehire by other departments.<sup>10</sup> In some cases, individual officers face personal liability in civil damage suits.<sup>11</sup>

Restructuring approaches also include the demilitarization of the police, ending the "1033" program that transfers surplus U.S. military hardware to police departments<sup>12</sup> and curbing overtime pay for participation in military training and exercises. Such limits become even more important as veterans of present-day occupations such as Iraq and Afghanistan join the force, particularly if they learned there to fear "locals,"

shoot first, and ask questions later.<sup>13</sup> A century's worth of embellishment by sensationalist TV fare and Hollywood action films has exacerbated the situation,<sup>14</sup> celebrating a problematic "warrior cop" syndrome<sup>15</sup> which has been part of police culture since departments studied the military occupation of the Philippines.<sup>16</sup>

With all these parallels and connections to the military, it is interesting that a critical feature of the armed forces – accountability to civilian authority – does not, as a practical matter, apply to the police.<sup>17</sup> "Qualified immunity" (courtesy of the U.S. Supreme Court<sup>18</sup>) and the power of police unions are key factors here. Might a civilian review board with teeth introduce accountability to desirable levels?

Critical Resistance supports all of these restructuring tactics (though it feels prosecuting "bad apples"<sup>19</sup> doesn't go far enough).

### *Defunding*

Defunding, favored by Critical Resistance, is not abolition. Instead, it means reductions in police budgets (which in some cases constitute a third of municipal expenses) in favor of greater investment in improving social, economic, and health conditions in underserved communities.<sup>20</sup> This is especially pressing as neoliberalism increases "precarity" in low-income and minority neighborhoods, privatizing schools and hospitals, and spiking unemployment, poverty, and evictions. Princeton professor Keeanga-Yamahtta Taylor warns that neoliberal elites are using police to manage the crises and conflicts their policies inevitably cause.<sup>21</sup> Even some police officers concede that "policing was never meant to solve all those problems."<sup>22</sup> (I recently explored these and related topics with Professors Erik Girvan<sup>23</sup> and Angela Addae<sup>24</sup> of the University of Oregon School of Law, who have engaged with local law enforcement regarding social justice concerns and possibilities for funding community-based programs and services under Oregon's 2013 Justice Reinvestment Act.)<sup>25</sup>

### *Abolition*

The most radical solution presently being discussed, favored by Critical Resistance and similar groups, is to dismantle the police force entirely.<sup>26</sup> Professor Alex Vitale's book on this topic, *The End of Policing*,<sup>27</sup> has gained a lot of attention, even in the mainstream media. Mariame Kaba and others stress that policing is not the entrenched cultural artifact we often experience, but rather began with slave patrols in the South and units formed to control rebellious workers in the North.<sup>28</sup>

Presumably, abolitionists would replace the police with community and/or citizen patrols.<sup>29</sup> Seattle's Capitol Hill Occupied Protest zone (or "CHOP") experiment approximated this approach.<sup>30</sup> It has been closed down, however, due to alleged violence in the area.<sup>31</sup> Still, a great deal of interest remains in "residents and local organizations [policing] their own neighborhoods and control[ling] violence – in a way that builds stronger communities,"<sup>32</sup> presumably with "anti-precarity" community investment.

### *Backlash*

Set against all attempts to change or modify policing is the power and resilience of police unions,<sup>33</sup> which are heavily involved in local politics.<sup>34</sup> Minneapolis Police Union President Bob Kroll has become an emblem of this form of resistance.<sup>35</sup> A further question is where the union movement in general comes out on this issue.<sup>36</sup> There are

also concerns about “strikes”--police disengagement or “de-policing.”<sup>37</sup> (A number of Atlanta police officers failed to show up for work after Officer Garrett Rolfe was charged with murder in the death of Rayshard Brooks, for example.<sup>38</sup>)

### *What's Next?*

Democratic Party politicians like Joe Biden, Stacy Abrams, and Jim Clyburn favor reform.<sup>39</sup> Others, like Alexandria Ocasio-Cortez, are talking about restructuring and even defunding.<sup>40</sup> There are even some Republicans entertaining reformist approaches – Tim Scott seems to have found his voice on racial matters, for example.<sup>41</sup>

Yet the two parties seem unable to move forward even in areas where there is some agreement.<sup>42</sup> A dramatic resolution from the Minneapolis City Council calling for the defunding of their city’s police after the Floyd murder<sup>43</sup> seems to have stalled.<sup>44</sup> Berkeley, California recently passed a reform measure to take police out of traffic stops and enforcement and replace them with staff from a newly-formed “Department of Transportation.” The police budget would be reduced accordingly. Some community members feel the proposal does not go far enough; the police are opposed.<sup>45</sup>

### **DOING A REAL SERVICE**

But what about “serve?” Presently, the in-group feels free to call upon the police to solve truly minor problems, in which no law has been broken, often involving issues beyond present police training. This puts a burden on the police force, diverting time and resources which might be better utilized to fund needed change.

The out-group, on the other hand, is very reluctant to call the police for service, for the simple reason that they experience police entering their communities only in “protect” mode, and it’s certainly not to protect *them*.<sup>46</sup>

Suppose we focused on the “service” function separately from “protect” -- a “motion to sever” in parliamentary terms, betting that the “serve” divide is narrower than the one emerging around “protect?” Perhaps some agreement could be fashioned to strengthen “serve” standing alone, creating an effective, parallel institution that serves *only*. If it works, the resulting consensus might push critical “protect” improvements forward.<sup>47</sup>

Some municipalities have already made progress in this direction.<sup>48</sup>

In Eugene, Oregon, Crisis Assistance Helping Out on the Streets (CAHOOTS) “serves” by providing 24/7 mobile crisis intervention. CAHOOTS teams of medical and mental health workers answer emergency calls, provide immediate stabilization, and follow up with assessment, information, referral, advocacy and transportation to the next step in treatment where needed.<sup>49</sup> They respond for suicide prevention, conflict resolution, substance abuse assistance, housing crises, resource connection and referrals, first aid, and non-emergency medical care. In the last year, CAHOOTS teams answered 17% of the local police department’s overall call volume with only 2% of the police department’s annual budget. They saved the city millions of dollars as well as dramatically reducing the number of armed police interventions.<sup>50</sup>

Policymakers everywhere are calling for such “rapid response” social workers, including mental-health care and addiction teams.<sup>51</sup> The growing chorus includes Minneapolis groups like Black Visions Collective and MPD 150.<sup>52</sup> Even President Trump has suggested social workers begin to accompany police on certain calls. With such emerg-

ing consensus, it is surprising that the details of transferring police “service” functions to municipal employees such as social workers and mental health workers has not been more closely examined.

I find myself drawn to an updated and localized version of FDR’s Civilian Conservation Corps,<sup>53</sup> expanded to cover environmental protection, community development, mediation of disputes, and assistance with the social safety net. I would call this the Civilian Community Service Corps (CCSC).

Here are some examples of roles CCSC members could play.

“Rapid response” mental health care, addiction aid, and social work is already on the table. But CCSC community organizers could dig deeper, addressing systemic, underlying conditions as well as emergencies.<sup>54</sup> This work would involve economic and social development. That means food, agricultural and energy coops; housing construction and renovation;<sup>55</sup> apprenticeships and job training; knowledge collectives like the Algebra project<sup>56</sup>; afterschool programs, and other school support.<sup>57</sup> Social safety net *advocates* could help people navigate the complex bureaucracies of social security, unemployment insurance, Medicare and Medicaid.

Family and neighborhood dispute mediators could reduce violence preemptively, without the use of force. Mobile physician's assistants, e-linked to medical doctors and EMTs for feedback and direction, could help improve cardiovascular health, diet, dental health, vision, and more.

But unlike present social workers, EMTs and the like, Corps members would be required to live in the community they serve. Emphasis would be placed on recruiting from the community, especially “boundary crossers,” “networkers,” and “go-to” people.<sup>58</sup> This approach could build both trust and social capital in affected neighborhoods.

This avoids the problem that social workers and mental health workers can be just as removed from the communities they serve as the police. However, racism and patriarchy can affect their judgment as well. What is the likelihood that a Black child will be separated from their family by a social worker as opposed to a white child, for example? What are the chances that a Black person with a mental illness will be diagnosed as a danger to themselves and others, as opposed to a white person with similar symptoms? On the bright side, at least social workers are not armed.<sup>59</sup>

Other problems remain to be addressed.

Where will the money come from? Local politicians and bureaucrats, DAs, and police leadership form an establishment of sorts that is invested in the present distribution of public money remaining undisturbed.<sup>60</sup> They may be willing to consider transferring problems that do not involve incapacitating violent offenders to a CCSC,<sup>61</sup> but might be unwilling to see the police budget reduced accordingly. They might even balk at creating a separate funding line for such a venture. Federal dollars might be needed for a truly comprehensive approach, recollecting FDR’s Civilian Conservation Corps, which was also a job creation program, much needed in the COVID-19 era.

Finally, the presence of a CCSC could affect the balance of political power on the local level, giving rise to even stronger opposition from the local establishment. The War on Poverty, which promoted “maximum feasible participation of the poor,” was shut down for this very reason, and supplanted by a “Model Cities” program placed directly under local establishment control.<sup>62</sup>

The questions of accountability to the community, funding, and the balance of power means organized community power (what I have elsewhere called “civic infrastructure”<sup>63</sup>) would be required to conceive, promote, and protect the CCSCs. To such ends, John McNamara evokes “Sociocracy”<sup>64</sup> in a blog for *The Workers' Paradise* on the police issue.<sup>65</sup> Sociocracy calls for small-scale democratic units, linked together in parliamentary fashion. (There is considerable overlap here with some versions of the “citizen’s assembly” that I have been studying and writing about for some time.<sup>66</sup>)

McNamara sees cities as “solidarity cooperatives in which the residents control and operate the functions of the city,” amplifying citizen engagement through a cooperative model of governance and management, and creating a “stronger new culture of community.”<sup>67</sup> Operating in such a context, the CCSCs could strengthen the communities in which they operated, helping correct the imbalance between government, business, and community we now all experience. (The question of fully restoring that balance is the focus of my present book project, “Democracy on a Human Scale.”)

*Harold McDougall of Howard University School of Law is a graduate of Harvard College and Yale Law School. He has a background in civil rights and community organizing, and served as Washington Bureau Chief for the NAACP in the late 1990s. Professor McDougall specializes in civic culture and civic infrastructure, focusing particularly on how these support sustainable social and economic development and human rights. Prof. McDougall has written numerous articles and blogs, as well as two books pursuing these themes – Black Baltimore: A New Theory of Community and African American Civil Rights in the Age of Obama: A History and Handbook. His articles include “The Challenges of Legal Education in the Neoliberal University,” (NLG Review, 2015) and “The Rebellious Law Professor: Combining Cause and Reflective Lawyering,” (J. Legal Education, 2015). The Rebellious Law Professor was featured in Scholastica’s spotlight blog. Areas of expertise include civil rights, sustainable development, human rights, land use and development, community development, and gentrification. He can be reached at hmcdougall@law.howard.edu.*

---

<sup>1</sup>Thanks to Howard University School of Law Dean Danielle Holley-Walker for research funding in support of this article.

<sup>2</sup> See generally, Economic Equality and Social Solidarity: MLK’s Neglected Legacies, *infra*, n. 55

<sup>3</sup> See generally, articles by Paul Butler, Lanre Bakare, Lydia Denworth, Derrick Johnson, and Cornel West in *The Guardian*, May 30, June 1, June 3, June 4, and June 24, 2020

<sup>4</sup> Matthew Yglesias, We shouldn't talk about Ferguson without talking about guns, *Vox*, Nov 26, 2014.

<sup>5</sup> See Radley Balko, *Rise of the Warrior Cop: The Militarization of America's Police Forces* (2014)

<sup>6</sup> See <http://criticalresistance.org/>

---

<sup>7</sup> See generally, Spencer Bokart-Lindell, *Debatable: The end of policing*, *New York Times* June 25, 2020.

<sup>8</sup> Id, quoting Alicia Garza (“Civilian review boards are one way to address that, she said – but they often lack teeth. To give them real power, they need to be able to hire and fire officers.”)

<sup>9</sup> See, e.g., Ashley Southall, *Officer Who Violently Shoved Protester in Brooklyn Is Charged With Assault*, *New York Times* June 9, 2020; Ray Sanchez and Elizabeth Joseph, *Louisville seeks to fire police officer in shooting of Breonna Taylor*, *CNN*, June 19, 2020; Guardian staff and agencies, *Elijah McClain: Colorado appoints special prosecutor to investigate 2019 police killing of 23-year-old Black man put in a neck hold in Aurora*, *The Guardian*, June 25, 2020.

<sup>10</sup> Cf. Chicago Mayor Lightfoot Calls for Licensing, Certification for Police Officers, *NBC5 Chicago*, June 11, 2020, <https://www.nbcchicago.com/news/local/lightfoot-calls-for-licensing-certification-for-police-officers/2288518>; and David Brand, *Two CUNY Law alums sponsored bill to repeal 50-a*, *Queens Daily Eagle*, June 18, 2020, <https://queenseagle.com/all/two-cuny-law-alums-sponsored-bill-to-repeal-50-a-long-island-city> (NY State law had shielded police personnel records from public view in legislative chambers)

<sup>11</sup> - Cf. Brentin Mock, *How Cities Offload the Cost of Police Brutality*, *Bloomberg City Lab*, June 4, 2020, (“Cities spend tens of millions of dollars on lawsuits over police violence and killings. But municipalities are effectively using residents to mortgage the cost.”) <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-06-04/the-financial-toll-of-police-brutality-to-citiesCityLab>

<sup>12</sup> See Alex S. Vitale, *Trump Is Trying to Militarize the Police. It Won’t Make Us Any Safer*. *Fortune*, August 29, 2017 (The Federal 1033 program, the Department of Justice’s “Cops Office,” and homeland security grants have channeled billions of dollars in military hardware to local police departments)

<sup>13</sup> Suzanne Gordon and Steve Early, *Trading One Uniform for Another: Can Police Be "De-Militarized" When So Many Cops Are Military Veterans?* *Portside*, June 19, 2020

<sup>14</sup> *NBC’S Think: How 30 years of 'COPS' changed the way America views policing*, May 21, 2019, <https://www.nbcnews.com/think/video/how-30-years-of-cops-changed-the-way-america-views-policing-60036677542> ; Adrian Horton, Idris Elba, Viola Davis and over 300 stars call on Hollywood to divest from police, *The Guardian*, June 23 2020

<sup>15</sup> Seth Stoughton, *Law Enforcement’s “Warrior” Problem*, 128 *Harv. L. Rev. F.* 225 (2015). In contrast, Mariame Kaba points out that a police officer’s typical day is spent “responding to noise complaints, issuing parking and traffic citations, and dealing with other noncriminal issues,” rather than “chas[ing] bank robbers [and] serial killers....[an officer might] make one felony arrest a year.”) *Compare*, *Bullying in Law Enforcement: End the Silence*, Sergeant Kathy Hillis, Miller County Sheriff’s Office. (2013), <https://www.cji.edu/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/bullying-in-law-enforcement-end-the-silence.pdf> and Althea Olson and Mike Wasilewski, *Bullies in the workplace: Sabotaging police culture*, *Police 1*, (2015), <https://www.policeone.com/police-jobs-and-careers/articles/8198287-Bullies-in-the-workplace-Sabotaging-police-culture/>

---

<sup>16</sup> Stuart Schrader, Yes, American police act like occupying armies. They literally studied their tactics, *The Guardian*, June 18, 2020

<sup>17</sup> The issue of federal agents dispatched from the Department Homeland Security (DHS) to supplant local authorities is another whole topic, beyond the scope of this article. *See generally*, Federal Agents Unleash Militarized Crackdown on Portland, *New York Times*, July 17, 2020, updated July 31, 2020. DHS Agents used tear gas against protesters and scooped them up in unmarked vans, but the ensuing uproar finally forced DHS to begin withdrawal. On July 29, Oregon Governor Kate Brown tweeted that the agents had “acted as an occupying force & brought violence. Starting tomorrow, all Customs and Border Protection & ICE officers will leave downtown Portland.” Still, President Trump’s threats to send more agents to more cities have not been retracted.

<sup>18</sup> Nina Totenberg, Supreme Court Weighs Qualified Immunity For Police Accused Of Misconduct, *NPR*, June 8, 2020. *Pierson v. Ray*, 386 U.S. 547 (1967) introduced the doctrine.

<sup>19</sup> For more on “bad apples, *see* Insecure, Frustrated Bully With Something To Prove Considering Career In Law Enforcement, *The Onion*, August 9, 2013. (The man in question said he felt personally obligated “to do whatever necessary to safeguard society,” to protect it from “bad people out there who think they can get away with doing whatever they want”, who need to be shown “who’s boss.” His “buddies at the gym...are gonna be cops too....it’ll be great!”)

<sup>20</sup> Sam Levin, Movement to defund police gains 'unprecedented' support across US, US policing, *The Guardian*, June 10, 2020; Jessica Corbett, Report on Broken Windows Spending Bolsters Call to Redirect \$1 Billion of NYPD Budget to Harmed Communities, *Common Dreams* June 24, 2020. A related development is the termination of police contracts to “protect” public schools. This has already occurred in Minneapolis and Oakland. (See *The Guardian*, June 25, 2020)

<sup>21</sup> America’s Moment of Reckoning”: Keeanga-Yamahtta Taylor & Cornel West on Uprising Against Racism, *Democracy Now!* July 03, 2020; see also Gin Armstrong and Derek Seidman , Corporate Backers of the Blue: How Corporations Bankroll U.S. Police Foundations, *Eyes on the Ties* June 22, 2020

<sup>22</sup> Brady Dennis, Mark Berman and Elahe Izadi, Dallas police chief says ‘we’re asking cops to do too much in this country’, *Washington Post*, July 11, 2016.

<sup>23</sup> <https://law.uoregon.edu/people/faculty/girvan>

<sup>24</sup> <https://law.uoregon.edu/people/directory/aaddae>

<sup>25</sup> ZOOM Interview, July 9, 2020. In his conversations with local law enforcement, Prof. Girvan has found agreement that police have become “gap fillers” called to deal with “all manner of situations that people do not want to deal with themselves,” notably where social support systems for issues of mental health, drug addiction, and homelessness are ineffective or non-existent. (Unpublished memo from Prof. Girvan, on file with the author.)

---

<sup>26</sup> Talya Zax , Abolishing the Police is a Radical Idea - That's Been Around for Over a Century, *Forward*, June 18, 2020; <https://www.npr.org/sections/codeswitch/2020/06/03/457251670/how-much-do-we-need-the-police>

<sup>27</sup> Alex S Vitale, The Answer to Police Violence is not 'Reform'. It's Defunding. Here's Why, *The Guardian* May 31, 2020. Vitale says that officers spend most of their time responding to noise complaints, issuing parking and traffic tickets, and making arrests for petty misdemeanors. Most violent and property crimes go unsolved.

<sup>28</sup> Mariame Kaba, Yes, We Mean Literally Abolish the Police, June 12, 2020, , *New York Times*  
Martin LaMonica, The racist roots of American policing: From slave patrols to traffic stops, *The Conversation*, June 4, 2019

<sup>29</sup> Jared Goyette, Citizen patrols organize across Minneapolis as confidence in the police force plummets - *Washington Post*, June 7, 2020

<sup>30</sup> Hallie Golden, Seattle protesters take over city blocks to create police-free 'autonomous zone', *The Guardian*, June 11, 2020.

<sup>31</sup> Seattle Chaz shooting: police say violent crowd prevented access to victims, *Associated Press*, June 21, 2020; Katelyn Burns, The violent end of the Capitol Hill Organized Protest, explained, *Vox*, Jul 2, 2020.

<sup>32</sup> Patrick Sharkey, Why do we need the police? *The Washington Post*, June 12, 2020

<sup>33</sup> Melissa Segura, There's One Big Reason Why Police Brutality Is So Common In The US. And That's The Police Unions, *Buzzfeed*, June 1, 2020

<sup>34</sup> Tom Perkins, Revealed: police unions spend millions to influence policy in biggest US cities, *The Guardian* June 23 2020

<sup>35</sup> Minnesota AFL-CIO Calls for Minneapolis Police Union President Bob Kroll's Immediate Resignation, *Portside*, June 3, 2020

<sup>36</sup> Frida Garza, They don't belong': calls grow to oust police from US labor movement, *The Guardian*, June 11 2020

<sup>37</sup> Mark L. Timpf, Police Reforms: Identifying The Potential Adverse Impacts And Challenges To Law Enforcement Agencies, *Thesis, Naval Postgraduate School Monterey, California* 2017; See also Tracey Amick-Peer, "Atlanta police sickout calls continue for third day," *11Alive* (06/20/2020). <https://www.11alive.com/article/news/local/protests/officer-sickout-blue-flu-third-day-atlanta/85-515886b4-7241-4320-8db3-e257fb2754a5> (protesting local DA's decision to bring charges in cases of police brutality and unjustified shootings)

<sup>38</sup> Adam Gabbatt, Trump defends officer who shot Rayshard Brooks as police call in sick, *The Guardian*, June 18 2020

---

<sup>39</sup> Somini Sengupta, Young New Yorkers Want You to Know Why They're Marching, *New York Times* June 13, 2020

<sup>40</sup> Graig Graziosi, US Rep Alexandria Ocasio-Cortez calls for NYPD to be defunded, *The Independent*, June 7 2020

<sup>41</sup> Sen. Tim Scott says a 'path forward' on police reform in Congress can be found, *NBC's Meet the Press*, June 14 2020

<sup>42</sup> Joan E Greve, US police reform bills unlikely to pass amid partisan divide despite calls for change, *The Guardian*, June 23 2020; Catie Edmondson, Senate Democrats Block G.O.P. Police Bill, Calling It Inadequate, *New York Times* June 24, 2020

<sup>43</sup> Dionne Searcey and John Eligon, Minneapolis Will Dismantle Its Police Force, Council Members Pledge, *New York Times* June 7, 2020

<sup>44</sup> Nicholas Bogel-Burroughs and Jack Healy, Minnesota Lawmakers Vowed Police Reform. They Couldn't Agree on Any. *New York Times* June 20, 2020; see also Holly Bailey, Plan to disband Minneapolis police halted in city commission vote, *Washington Post*, August 5, 2020. Compare, Benjamin Wallace-Wells, Can Minneapolis Dismantle Its Police Department? *The New Yorker*, August 8, 2020.

<sup>45</sup> Creating a new department is at least a year away and will probably require state legislation to finalize it. Sam Levin, California city moves to replace police with unarmed civilians for traffic stops, *The Guardian*, July 15 2020

<sup>46</sup> Conversation with Prof. Kathleen Morris of Golden Gate Law School. Prof. Morris is an expert on state and local government law and policy. <https://www.ggu.edu/shared-content/faculty/bio/kathleen-morris> July 13, 2020. Prof. Morris suggests that a primary role of the police is to protect the larger community (the "in-group") against black, brown, poor and disabled people. (disabled, meaning people struggling with mental illness or drug addiction)

<sup>47</sup> Prof. Girvan's conversations with local law enforcement "suggest that, in some areas at least, there is some common ground between the leaders of law enforcement institutions and core ideas of the defund the police movement." See *supra*, note 22.

<sup>48</sup> Dionne Searcey, What Would Efforts to Defund or Disband Police Departments Really Mean? *New York Times* June 8, 2020

<sup>49</sup> <https://whitebirdclinic.org/services/cahoots/>

<sup>50</sup> Ana V. Smith, There's Already an Alternative to Calling the Police, *Mother Jones*, June 17, 2020; see also Loretta Graceffo, Community Peacemakers in Chicago Offer a Proven Alternative to Policing, *Portside*, July 20, 2020

<https://www.portside.org/2020-07-20/community-peacemakers-chicago-offer-proven-alternative-policing>

---

<sup>51</sup> See Bokak-Lindell, *supra*, n.7, citing Philip V. McHarris and Thenjiwe McHarris, No More Money for the Police, *New York Times* May 30, 2020 (“If someone calls 911 to report a drug overdose, health care teams rush to the scene; the police wouldn’t get involved. If a person calls 911 to complain about people who are homeless, rapid response social workers would provide them with housing support and other resources.”).

<sup>52</sup> <https://www.blackvisionsmn.org/> (“Black Visions Collective (BLVC) believes in a future where all Black people have autonomy, safety is community-led, and we are in the right relationship within our ecosystems”); <https://www.mpd150.com/about/> (“MPD150 is a participatory, horizontally-organized effort by local organizers, researchers, artists and activists...[dedicated to] practical abolitionist strategies.”)

<sup>53</sup> <https://www.history.com/topics/great-depression/civilian-conservation-corps>

<sup>54</sup> See Vitale, The Answer to Police Violence is not 'Reform'. It's Defunding.) Here's Why, *Portside*, June 9, 2020 (“instead of gang units, we need community-based anti-violence programs, trauma services and jobs for young people; instead of school police we need more counselors, after-school programs, and restorative justice programs.”)

<sup>55</sup> Habitat for Humanity provides a good example, engaging community members to build or renovate the houses in which they will live. <https://www.habitat.org/>

<sup>56</sup> <https://algebra.org/wp/>

<sup>57</sup> Pre-school workers, teacher’s aides, parent advocates, Saturday schools, and the like.

<sup>58</sup> See, e.g., Bruce Adams and John Parr, *Boundary Crossers: Case Studies of How Ten of America's Metropolitan Regions Work* (1997)

<sup>59</sup> Conversation with Prof. Morris, *supra*, note 45.

<sup>60</sup> These and other obstacles became clearer as I discussed CAHOOTS with Professors Girvan Addae, *supra*, note 22. (According to Prof. Girvan, “one of the barriers [local politicians] report facing in [supporting “serve” alternatives]...is local political pressure to be ‘tough on crime.’ I have heard from some law enforcement leaders that they can get funding for a new officer or assistant DA, but not counselor of social worker.”)

<sup>61</sup> Prof. Girvan, *op cit*, observes that “law enforcement officers have a limited set of training, tools, and facilities that ultimately focus on incapacitation. As such they are not well equipped to address underlying issues or, ultimately, respond constructively to many of the situations to which they are asked to respond. They are also fairly expensive. As one pointed out, their officers will sit in a hospital for 10 hours with someone who is experiencing a mental health crisis where there is no one else to do so, but it is not the best use of resources..... Consistent with this, the law enforcement leaders I have spoken to in this area also have generally been supporting of alternative models...in which there are rapid response social support systems available, other than the police, to respond to issues that do not require a gun, handcuffs, and jail.”

---

<sup>62</sup> <https://urbanomnibus.net/2016/11/making-sense-of-model-cities/?printpage=true>

<sup>63</sup> McDougall, Social Change Requires Civic Infrastructure, 56 *Howard Law Journal* 801 (2013)

<sup>64</sup> <https://www.sociocracy.info/what-is-sociocracy/>

<sup>65</sup> McNamara, *supra*, n 53

<sup>66</sup> Beginning with Social Change Requires Civic Infrastructure, *supra* n. 53, and most recently with McDougall, Economic Equality and Social Solidarity: MLK's Neglected Legacies, 14 *Harvard Law & Policy Review* 701 (2020)

<sup>67</sup> *Id.* For more radical versions of this idea, see, e.g., Murray Bookchin, Debbie Bookchin (ed), *The Next Revolution: Popular Assemblies and the Promise of Direct Democracy* (2015) and Modibo Kadalie, *Pan-African Social Ecology* (2019)